

Fast computation of interpolation bases in Popov form for arbitrary shifts

Vincent Neiger ^{§,†,‡}

Claude-Pierre Jeannerod[§] Éric Schost[†] Gilles Villard[§]

[§]AriC, LIP, École Normale Supérieure de Lyon, France

[†]University of Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

[‡]Partially supported by the mobility grants *Explo'ra doc* from *Région Rhône-Alpes* /
Globalink Research Award - Inria from *Mitacs & Inria* / *Programme Avenir Lyon Saint-Étienne*

ISSAC 2016, Waterloo, July 22, 2016



Approximation and Interpolation

Padé-like approximation

Input: $\mathbf{F} = (f_1, \dots, f_m)$ polynomials over \mathbb{K} , order σ points x_1, \dots, x_σ

Find $\mathbf{p} = (p_1, \dots, p_m)$ polynomials such that

$$\begin{cases} p_1 f_1 + \dots + p_m f_m = 0 \text{ mod } X^\sigma \text{ mod } \prod_{1 \leq i \leq \sigma} (X - x_i) \\ \text{minimal deg}(\mathbf{p}) \end{cases}$$

Approximation and Interpolation

Padé-like approximation

Input: $\mathbf{F} = (f_1, \dots, f_m)$ polynomials over \mathbb{K} , order σ points x_1, \dots, x_σ

Find $\mathbf{p} = (p_1, \dots, p_m)$ polynomials such that

$$\begin{cases} p_1 f_1 + \dots + p_m f_m = 0 \pmod{X^\sigma} \pmod{\prod_{1 \leq i \leq \sigma} (X - x_i)} \\ \text{minimal } \deg(\mathbf{p}) \end{cases}$$

Guruswami-Sudan list-decoding

Input: points $\{(x_i, y_i)\}_{1 \leq i \leq \sigma}$ in \mathbb{K}^2

Find $Q(X, Y) = Q_0 + Q_1 Y + \dots + Q_{m-1} Y^{m-1}$ such that

- $Q(x_i, y_i) = 0$ for all i
- minimal $\deg_X(Q)$

Why would one care?

Central problem:

- Hermite-Padé approximants
 - ↪ **guessing** linear differential equations
- **order basis**
 - ↪ simultaneous Padé approximants [Nielsen-Storjohann, 2016]
 - ↪ computation of normal forms [Neiger, 2016]
 - ↪ kernel bases [Zhou-Labahn-Storjohann, 2012]
- **list-decoding** algorithms
 - ↪ Reed-Solomon codes [Guruswami-Sudan, 1998]
 - ↪ folded Reed-Solomon codes [Guruswami-Rudra, 2006]
 - ↪ robust Private Information Retrieval [Devet-Goldberg-Heninger, 2012]

Example

Hermite-Padé approximation: $p_1 f_1 + \dots + p_m f_m = 0 \pmod{X^\sigma}$

Example with $m = 4, \sigma = 128$

$$\mathbf{f} = \begin{bmatrix} f_1 \\ f_2 \\ f_3 \\ f_4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 + X \\ X + X^2 \\ X^2 + X^3 \end{bmatrix}$$

basis of solutions:

$$\mathbf{P} = \begin{bmatrix} X + 1 & -1 & & \\ X - 1 & X + 1 & -1 & \\ X + 1 & X - 1 & X + 1 & -1 \\ X^{125} & X^{125} & -X^{125} & X^{125} \end{bmatrix}$$

with minimal row degrees

General interpolation problem

Several equations

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} p_1 f_{11} + \cdots + p_m f_{1m} = 0 \text{ mod } M_1 \\ \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \vdots \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \qquad \vdots \\ p_1 f_{n1} + \cdots + p_m f_{nm} = 0 \text{ mod } M_n \end{array} \right.$$

where M_1, \dots, M_n are known through roots and multiplicities

interpolation basis = basis of the module of interpolants

$$\{ \mathbf{p} = (p_1, \dots, p_m) \in \mathbb{K}[X]^m \mid \mathbf{p}\mathbf{F} = 0 \text{ mod } \mathbf{M} \}$$

Specific case of vector rational interpolation [Beckermann - Labahn, 2000]

Problem

Input: roots and multiplicities of nonzero moduli M_1, \dots, M_n
system matrix $\mathbf{F} \in \mathbb{K}[X]^{m \times n}$
shift $\mathbf{s} \in \mathbb{Z}^m$

Output: \mathbf{P} the \mathbf{s} -Popov interpolation basis

$$\sigma = \deg(M_1) + \dots + \deg(M_n)$$

- 1 minimal interpolation bases
- 2 global picture of existing algorithms
- 3 fast algorithm

Minimal interpolation bases

interpolation basis: nonsingular matrix $\mathbf{P} = \begin{bmatrix} p_{11} & \cdots & p_{1m} \\ & \vdots & \\ p_{m1} & \cdots & p_{mm} \end{bmatrix}$

s-minimal basis \mathbf{P} : minimal **s**-row degrees

Shift: integers $\mathbf{s} = (s_1, \dots, s_m)$ used as additive degree weights

$$\deg_{\mathbf{s}}([p_1 \ \cdots \ p_m]) = \max_j (\deg(p_j) + s_j)$$

Shifts can serve as **degree constraints**:

$$\deg(p_j) < N_j \text{ for all } j \Leftrightarrow \deg_{(-N_1, \dots, -N_m)}(\mathbf{p}) < 0$$

Basis in normal form

s-Popov basis = **s-minimal** + column normalized

$$\begin{array}{l} \mathbf{s} = (0, 0, 0, 0) \\ \text{Popov} \end{array} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 4 & 3 & 3 & 3 \\ 3 & 4 & 3 & 3 \\ 3 & 3 & 4 & 3 \\ 3 & 3 & 3 & 4 \end{bmatrix} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 7 & 0 & 1 & 5 \\ 0 & 1 & & 0 \\ & & 2 & \\ 6 & 0 & 1 & 6 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \mathbf{s} = (0, 2, 4, 6) \\ \text{s-Popov} \end{array} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 7 & 4 & 2 & 0 \\ 6 & 5 & 2 & 0 \\ 6 & 4 & 3 & 0 \\ 6 & 4 & 2 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 8 & 5 & 1 & \\ 7 & 6 & 1 & \\ & & 2 & \\ 0 & 1 & & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \mathbf{s} = (0, \sigma, 2\sigma, 3\sigma) \\ \text{Hermite} \end{array} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 16 & & & \\ 15 & 0 & & \\ 15 & & 0 & \\ 15 & & & 0 \end{bmatrix} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 4 & & & \\ 3 & 7 & & \\ 1 & 5 & 3 & \\ 3 & 6 & 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

- normal form
- average column degree σ/m

\rightsquigarrow many useful properties

[Nielsen-Storjohann, ISSAC 2016]

Average degrees

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega} \sigma / m)$$

assumptions on the shift



Matrix multiplication

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega} \sigma)$$



Structure

$$\mathcal{O}(m^2 \sigma^2)$$



Dense linear algebra

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(\sigma^{\omega}) \text{ with}$$

[Storjohann, 2006]

[Zhou-Labahn, 2012]



[Giorgi-Jeannerod-Villard, 2003]

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega} \sigma / n)$$

[Beckermann-Labahn, 1994]

[Sergeyev, 1987]

[Paszkowski, 1987]

[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1991]

arbitrary shift
Popov basis

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-Villard, 2015]

[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1992]
[Kötter-Nielsen-Høholdt, 1999]
[Beckermann-Labahn, 2000]

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-Villard, 2015]

Here: $\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(m^\omega \sigma / m)$ with arbitrary shift
Popov basis

Average degrees

$$\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(m^\omega \sigma / m)$$

assumptions on the shift

Matrix multiplication

$$\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(m^\omega \sigma)$$

Structure

$$\mathcal{O}(m^2 \sigma^2)$$

Dense linear algebra

$$\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(\sigma^\omega) \text{ with}$$

[Storjohann, 2006]
[Zhou-Labahn, 2012]

[Giorgi-Jeannerod-Villard, 2003]
 $\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(m^\omega \sigma / n)$

[Beckermann-Labahn, 1994]

[Sergeyev, 1987]
[Paszkowski, 1987]
[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1991]

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-
Villard, 2015]

[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1992]
[Kötter-Nielsen-Høholdt, 1999]
[Beckermann-Labahn, 2000]

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-Villard, 2015]

arbitrary shift
Popov basis

Divide-and-conquer algorithm

Relying on fast polynomial matrix multiplication

(generalizing [Beckermann-Labahn, 1994] from Hermite-Padé to interpolation)

- $\mathbf{P}^{(1)} \leftarrow \mathbf{s}$ -minimal for first $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{F}
- $\mathbf{G} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{F} , $\mathbf{t} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{s}
- $\mathbf{P}^{(2)} \leftarrow \mathbf{t}$ -minimal for last $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{G}
- return $\mathbf{P} = \mathbf{P}^{(2)}\mathbf{P}^{(1)}$

\rightsquigarrow \mathbf{P} is a \mathbf{s} -minimal interpolation basis

$$\deg(\mathbf{P}^{(1,2)}) \leq \sigma/2 \Rightarrow \deg(\mathbf{P}) \leq \sigma \rightsquigarrow \text{Cost bound } \mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma)$$

How to obtain $\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma/m)$? ... why is it even feasible?

Overview

- 1 why feasible? \rightsquigarrow **s-Popov** basis
- 2 solution when diagonal degrees are **known**
- 3 how to **find** diagonal degrees recursively
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(1)} \leftarrow$ **s-Popov**
 - ...
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(2)} \leftarrow$ **t-Popov**
 - return $\mathbf{P} = \mathbf{P}^{(2)}\mathbf{P}^{(1)}$

Too large output (1/2)

Hermite-Padé approximation with $m = 4, \sigma = 128, \mathbf{s} = \mathbf{0}$

$$\mathbf{F} = \begin{bmatrix} f_1 \\ f_2 \\ f_3 \\ f_4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 + X \\ X + X^2 \\ X^2 + X^3 \end{bmatrix},$$

0-minimal basis:

$$\begin{bmatrix} X + 1 & -1 & & \\ X - 1 & X + 1 & -1 & \\ X + 1 & X - 1 & X + 1 & -1 \\ X^{125} & X^{125} & -X^{125} & X^{125} \end{bmatrix}$$

- unbalanced row degrees (1, 1, 1, 125)
- average row degrees = $\sigma/m \dots$ because $\mathbf{s} = \mathbf{0}$

Too large output (2/2)

Extend this to $m = 8, \sigma = 128, \mathbf{s} = (0, 0, 0, 0, \sigma, \sigma, \sigma, \sigma)$

with \mathbf{F} : **same** f_1, f_2, f_3, f_4 / **random** f_5, f_6, f_7, f_8

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & \\ 125 & 125 & 125 & 125 & & & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & 0 & & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & 0 & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & & 0 & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & & & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

- some \mathbf{s} -minimal basis
- size $\Theta(m^2\sigma)$
- beyond target $\mathcal{O}^\sim(m^\omega\sigma/m)$

Too large output (2/2)

Extend this to $m = 8, \sigma = 128, \mathbf{s} = (0, 0, 0, 0, \sigma, \sigma, \sigma, \sigma)$

with \mathbf{F} : **same** f_1, f_2, f_3, f_4 / **random** f_5, f_6, f_7, f_8

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & \\ 125 & 125 & 125 & 125 & & & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & 0 & & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & 0 & & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & & 0 & \\ 124 & 124 & 124 & 124 & & & & 0 \end{bmatrix} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & & & & & & \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & & & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 125 & & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & 0 & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & 0 & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & & 0 & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & & & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

- **some** \mathbf{s} -minimal basis
- size $\Theta(m^2\sigma)$
- **beyond target** $\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma/m)$
- **the** \mathbf{s} -Popov basis
- diagonal entries dominant
- average column degree σ/m

When diagonal degrees are known

Input: \mathbf{F} , \mathbf{s} , and $\mathbf{d} = (d_1, \dots, d_m)$ the diagonal degrees of \mathbf{P}

Central fact: \mathbf{P} is also the $-\mathbf{d}$ -Popov basis

Algorithm:

Step 1. $\mathbf{B} \leftarrow$ some $-\mathbf{d}$ -minimal basis for \mathbf{F}
partial linearization [Storjohann, 2006] + small shifts algorithm

Step 2. $\mathbf{P} \leftarrow$ normalize \mathbf{B} into $-\mathbf{d}$ -Popov form

$$\mathbf{B} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & & & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & & & & & \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & & & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & 0 & & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & 0 & & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & & 0 & & \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 124 & & & & 0 & \end{bmatrix} \quad \mathbf{d} = (1, 1, 1, 125, 0, 0, 0, 0) \quad \text{or} \quad \mathbf{B} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 125 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Finding diagonal degrees recursively

- If $\sigma \leq m$: compute \mathbf{P} by dense linear algebra
- Else:
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(1)} \leftarrow \mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ for first $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - $\mathbf{G} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{F} , $\mathbf{t} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{s}
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(2)} \leftarrow \mathbf{t}\text{-Popov}$ for last $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{G}
 - Find the diagonal degrees \mathbf{d} of \mathbf{P}
 - $\mathbf{B} \leftarrow -\mathbf{d}\text{-minimal}$ for all σ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - Return $\mathbf{P} = \text{lm}_{-\mathbf{d}}(\mathbf{B})^{-1}\mathbf{B}$

cost bound: $\mathcal{O}(m^{\omega-1}M(\sigma) \log(\sigma) \log(\sigma/m)^2)$

Finding diagonal degrees recursively

- If $\sigma \leq m$: compute \mathbf{P} by dense linear algebra
- Else:
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(1)} \leftarrow \mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ for first $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - $\mathbf{G} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{F} , $\mathbf{t} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{s}
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(2)} \leftarrow \mathbf{t}\text{-Popov}$ for last $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{G}
 - Find the diagonal degrees \mathbf{d} of \mathbf{P}
 - $\mathbf{B} \leftarrow -\mathbf{d}\text{-minimal}$ for all σ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - Return $\mathbf{P} = \text{lm}_{-\mathbf{d}}(\mathbf{B})^{-1}\mathbf{B}$

Product $\mathbf{P}^{(2)}\mathbf{P}^{(1)}$

- not in $\mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ form, degrees too large for efficient computation
- \mathbf{P} is its $\mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ form

cost bound: $\mathcal{O}(m^{\omega-1}M(\sigma) \log(\sigma) \log(\sigma/m)^2)$

Finding diagonal degrees recursively

- If $\sigma \leq m$: compute \mathbf{P} by dense linear algebra
- Else:
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(1)} \leftarrow \mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ for first $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - $\mathbf{G} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{F} , $\mathbf{t} \leftarrow$ update \mathbf{s}
 - $\mathbf{P}^{(2)} \leftarrow \mathbf{t}\text{-Popov}$ for last $\sigma/2$ constraints and \mathbf{G}
 - Find the diagonal degrees \mathbf{d} of \mathbf{P}
 - $\mathbf{B} \leftarrow -\mathbf{d}\text{-minimal}$ for all σ constraints and \mathbf{F}
 - Return $\mathbf{P} = \text{lm}_{-\mathbf{d}}(\mathbf{B})^{-1}\mathbf{B}$

Product $\mathbf{P}^{(2)}\mathbf{P}^{(1)}$

- not in $\mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ form, degrees too large for efficient computation
- \mathbf{P} is its $\mathbf{s}\text{-Popov}$ form

\rightsquigarrow diagonal degrees of \mathbf{P} : $\mathbf{d} = \mathbf{d}^{(1)} + \mathbf{d}^{(2)}$

cost bound: $\mathcal{O}(m^{\omega-1}M(\sigma) \log(\sigma) \log(\sigma/m)^2)$

Here: $\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma/m)$ with arbitrary shift
Popov normal form

Average degrees

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma/m)$$

assumptions on the shift

Matrix multiplication

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma)$$

Structure

$$\mathcal{O}(m^2\sigma^2)$$

Dense linear algebra

$$\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(\sigma^{\omega})$$

with arbitrary shift
Popov basis

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-Villard, 2015]

[Storjohann, 2006]
[Zhou-Labahn, 2012]

[Giorgi-Jeannerod-Villard, 2003]
 $\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega}\sigma/n)$

[Beckermann-Labahn, 1994]

[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1992]
[Kötter-Nielsen-Høholdt, 1999]
[Beckermann-Labahn, 2000]

[Sergeyev, 1987]
[Paszkowski, 1987]
[Van Barel-Bultheel, 1991]

[Jeannerod-Neiger-Schost-Villard, 2015]

List-decoding: Sudan algorithm

given σ points $\{(x_1, y_1), \dots, (x_\sigma, y_\sigma)\}$

f solution: $\deg f \leq k$ and $f(x_i) = y_i$ for $\geq \sigma - e$ points

[Sudan, 1997]

- Compute degree constraints m and b
- Interpolation step
compute $Q(X, Y) = Q_0 + Q_1 Y + \dots + Q_m Y^m$ such that
 - Q_0, \dots, Q_m have small shifted degree: $\deg Q_j < b - jk$
 - $Q(x_i, y_i) = 0$ for all points
- Root-finding step
the solutions f are among the Y -roots of $Q(X, Y)$

Interpolation steps in related contexts

[Guruswami - Sudan, 1999]

List-decoding of Reed-Solomon codes,
further **extends** the error-correction bound

Compute $Q(X, Y) = Q_0 + Q_1 Y + \dots + Q_m Y^m$ such that

- Q_0, \dots, Q_m have small shifted degree
- $Q(x_i, y_i) = 0$ **with multiplicity** μ for all points

Interpolation steps in related contexts

[Kötter - Vardy, 2003]

Soft-decision decoding of Reed-Solomon codes

x_1, \dots, x_n are not pairwise distinct

Compute $Q(X, Y) = Q_0 + Q_1 Y + \dots + Q_m Y^m$ such that

- Q_0, \dots, Q_m have small shifted degree
- $Q(x_i, y_i) = 0$ with multiplicity μ_i for all points

Interpolation steps in related contexts

[Guruswami - Rudra, 2006]

List-decoding of folded Reed-Solomon codes:

extends the error-correction bound up to the information-theoretic limit

[Devet - Goldberg - Heninger, 2012]

Optimally robust Private Information Retrieval

Compute $Q(X, Y_1, \dots, Y_s) = \sum_{(j_1, \dots, j_s) \in \Gamma} Q_{j_1, \dots, j_s} Y_1^{j_1} \cdots Y_s^{j_s}$ such that

- the $Q_{(j_1, \dots, j_s)}$ have small shifted degree
- $Q(x_i, y_{i1}, \dots, y_{is}) = 0$ with multiplicity μ for all points

Ingredient 3: linearizing at small orders (1/3)

Base case $\sigma = m$, goal $\mathcal{O}^{\sim}(m^{\omega})$

Input: points x_1, \dots, x_m , evaluation matrix $\mathbf{E} \in \mathbb{K}^{m \times m}$

Output: $\mathbf{0}$ -minimal interpolation basis \mathbf{P}

sum of row degrees $\leq m \Rightarrow$ average degree in the matrix ≤ 1

Complete linearization over \mathbb{K}

$$\mathcal{K} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{E} \\ \mathbf{E}\mathbf{D} \\ \mathbf{E}\mathbf{D}^2 \\ \vdots \\ \mathbf{E}\mathbf{D}^M \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{where } \mathbf{D} = \text{Diag}(x_1, \dots, x_m)$$

minimal interpolation basis \longleftrightarrow minimal linear relations between rows of \mathcal{K}

Fast computation of those relations, in $\mathcal{O}(m^{\omega} \log m)$

Iterative algorithm [Van Barel-Bultheel / Beckermann-Labahn / Kötter]

1. $\mathbf{P} = \begin{bmatrix} -\mathbf{p}_1 \\ \vdots \\ -\mathbf{p}_m \end{bmatrix} = \text{Identity in } \mathbb{K}[X]^{m \times m}$

2. For i from 1 to σ :

a. Compute evaluations $\begin{bmatrix} (\mathbf{p}_1 \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i) \\ \vdots \\ (\mathbf{p}_m \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i) \end{bmatrix} = (\mathbf{P} \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i)$

b. Choose pivot π with smallest s_π such that $(\mathbf{p}_\pi \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i) \neq 0$
Update pivot shift $s_\pi = s_\pi + 1$

c. Eliminate:

$$\text{For } j \neq \pi \text{ do } \mathbf{p}_j = \mathbf{p}_j - \frac{(\mathbf{p}_j \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i)}{(\mathbf{p}_\pi \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i)} \mathbf{p}_\pi \quad /* \forall j \neq \pi, (\mathbf{p}_j \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i) = 0 */$$
$$\mathbf{p}_\pi = (X - x_i) \mathbf{p}_\pi \quad /* (\mathbf{p}_\pi \cdot \mathbf{f})(x_i) = 0 */$$

After i iterations: \mathbf{P} MIB of for (x_1, \dots, x_i)